



Meeting Date: 10/25/2021  
Item Number: 4b  
Time Estimate: 45 minutes

## CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE AGENDA REPORT

**SUBJECT:** CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW SINGLE-UNIT DWELLING ON PROPERTY WITHIN THE MILL STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

**PROJECT ADDRESS:** 1156 Peach Street

**BY:** Walter Oetzell, Assistant Planner  
Phone Number: 781-7593  
Email: woetzell@slocity.org

**FILE NUMBER:** ARCH-0541-2021

**FROM:** Brian Leveille, Senior Planner

---

### RECOMMENDATION

Provide a recommendation to the Community Development Director regarding the consistency of the proposed new construction with the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance (SLOMC Ch. 14.01).

### 1.0 BACKGROUND

The applicant proposes to construct a new single-family dwelling (see Project Plans, Attachment 1) at 1156 Peach Street, a vacant residential property located about 50 feet west of Toro Street (a single-family dwelling that existed on the site has been demolished). The property is not included in the Inventory of Historic Resources but is located within the Mill Street Historic District

### 2.0 DISCUSSION

Mill Street Historic District. As described in the City's Historical Preservation Program Guidelines (HPPG, see Attachment B), the Mill Street Historic District is a residential neighborhood developed at the turn of the 20th century, with the majority of the existing buildings dating from the 1900s to 1920s, the district's primary period of historical and architectural significance. Among the common site features and characteristics identified in the district are consistent 20-foot street yard setbacks, front building facades oriented parallel to the street, and front entries oriented toward street, with prominent walk, stairs and entry porches.

Architectural Styles. The majority of historic homes are more modest residences, historically accommodating, for example, many county employees, owing to its proximity to the courthouse (HPPG, Attachment B). The district's residential architectural styles reflect the prosperity of its residents, with the older and more elaborate residences within the 1300 block of Palm and Mill Streets. Most buildings in this district were built by local builders, and the District encompasses many different architectural styles, including revival styles popular at the turn of the twentieth century, such as Neo-classic Row House, Victorian, Tudor Revival, Mission Revival, and Craftsman Bungalow, with many homes borrowing architectural details from more than one style. Historic Preservation Program

ARCH-0541-2021 (1156 Peach)  
Cultural Heritage Committee Report – October 25, 2021

Guidelines (Attachment B) describe predominant architectural features present in the District, typical features of one- and two-story dwellings of the District's varied styles.

New construction within historic districts is subject to review by the Cultural Heritage Committee (Historic Preservation Ordinance § 14.01.030 (C)), following the City's Historic Preservation Program Guidelines for Construction in Historic Districts (HPPG § 3.2, see Attachment C). In addition, such construction is to conform to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (SOI Standards). The Committee will make a recommendation to the Community Development Director as to the consistency of the proposed work with applicable historical preservation policies and standards and may recommend conditions of project approval as appropriate

### 3.0 EVALUATION

As depicted in Project Plans (Attachment A), the applicant proposes to construct a new two-story single-family dwelling exhibiting a Spanish Revival style (see Figure 1). The building exhibits a characteristic stepped façade, sloped bases, corbeling at the garage doors, and half round top entry door. It employs stucco surface materials and a traditional fenestration pattern with arched doors and windows appropriate to its Spanish Revival architectural style.



*Figure 1: Proposed new dwelling*

### 3.1 Historical Preservation Program Guidelines

Section	Subject
§ 3.2.1	<p><u>Architecturally compatible development within Historic Districts</u></p> <p>New structures in historic districts shall be designed to be architecturally compatible with the district's prevailing historic character as measured by their consistency with the scale, massing, rhythm, signature architectural elements, exterior materials, siting and street yard setbacks of the district's historic structures, as described in Figures 2 and 3. New structures are not required to copy or imitate historic structures, or seek to create the illusion that a new building is historic</p>
§ 3.2.2	<p><u>Architectural Compatibility</u></p> <p>The CHC reviews development in historic districts for architectural compatibility with nearby historic resources, and for consistency with applicable design and preservation policies, standards, and historic district descriptions in Section 5.2. New development should not sharply contrast with, significantly block public views of, or visually detract from, the historic architectural character of historically designated structures located adjacent to the property to be developed, or detract from the prevailing historic architectural character of the historic district</p>

The City's Historical Preservation Program Guidelines identify "one- and occasionally two-story houses" as a predominant architectural feature of the Mill Street Historic District. The proposed new construction exhibits a Spanish Revival style, with the characteristic architectural elements described above. It employs stucco surface materials and a traditional fenestration pattern with arched doors and windows appropriate to its architectural style, which is identified in the Guidelines as one of the many different architectural styles encompassed by the Mill Street District. As such, it does not appear that it would visually detract from the historic character of adjacent structures or the district as a whole, and being oriented toward and parallel to the street, would not block views of any historic resources.

### 3.2 Secretary of Interior's Standards

<b>Standard 9:</b> New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.	
Recommended	Not Recommended
<b><i>Setting (District / Neighborhood)</i></b>	
Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction that are compatible with the historic character of the setting that preserve the historic relationship between the buildings and the landscape	Introducing new construction into historic districts which is visually incompatible or that destroys historic relationships within the setting, or which damages or destroys important landscape features

As described above, the new dwelling has been designed in a Spanish Revival style, consistent with the architectural styles prevalent in the Mill Street District, as described in Historical Preservation Program Guidelines, introduces no visually incompatible elements to the district, and is well integrated into the district's traditional pattern of development.

### 3.3 Conclusion

The proposed new dwelling is consistent with relevant Historical Preservation Program Guidelines and Secretary of Interior's Standards for new construction in historic districts. With its Spanish Revival architectural style and integration into the traditional development pattern it exhibits a scale, massing, rhythm, signature architectural elements, exterior materials, siting and street yard setbacks that are consistent with the district's character.

## 4.0 ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Construction of a new single-family dwelling is categorically exempt from CEQA environmental review, as New Construction of Small Structures (Guidelines § 15303 (a)).

ARCH-0541-2021 (1156 Peach)  
Cultural Heritage Committee Report – October 25, 2021

## **5.0 ACTION ALTERNATIVES**

1. Staff Recommended Action: Recommend that the Community Development Director find the proposed project consistent with the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance, under Historical Preservation Program Guidelines for new construction in Historic Districts
2. Continue review to another date with direction to staff and applicant.
3. Recommend that the Community Development Director find the project inconsistent with historical preservation policies, citing specific areas of inconsistency.

## **6.0 ATTACHMENTS**

A – Project Plans (1156 Peach)  
B – Mill Street Historic District (HPPG)  
C – Construction in Historic Districts (HPPG)